



**White Oak ISD
Library Materials Formal Challenge Rubric and
REPORT OF FINDINGS**

Library Materials Challenge Filing Date: 10/8/2025 Decision Date: 1/6/26

Library Material to be Reviewed: Heartstopper Volume 1-5

Type of Resource: Book Periodical Other: _____

Author: Alice Oseman Copyright Date: 2019, 2020, 2021, 2023

Committee Assignment Date: 10/16/2025

Committee Composition [mark as applicable and identify names]:

Required: Librarian: Lori Davis
 Instructional Staff Member (must be familiar with the challenged material's content):
Debbi Deck

Optional: District-Level Staff: _____
 Secondary-Level Student(s): _____
 Parent(s)/Guardian(s): John Carr, Amber Richardson, Heather Rejeck
 Any other appropriate individual(s): _____

Applicable Board Policy, EFB (LOCAL): All members of the committee shall review the challenged resource in its entirety. As soon as reasonably possible, the committee shall meet and **determine whether the challenged material confirms to Board Policy EFB and whether the material will continue to be available in the library.** The committee shall prepare a written report of its findings and provide copies to the Superintendent, the school librarian, the individual submitting the challenge, and any other appropriate staff.

The committee must make written findings of fact to support its recommendation, with an explanation of the basis of each finding, for each criteria of relevance to a board's actions on the recommendation, below. A material shall not be removed based solely on the ideas contained in the material or the personal background of the author of the material or the characters in the material.

Definitions

- Harmful Material – Material whose dominant theme taken as a whole: (A) appeals to the prurient interest of a minor, in sex, nudity, or excretion; (B) is patently offensive to prevailing standards in the adult community as a whole with respect to what is suitable for minors; and (C) is utterly without redeeming social value for minors. Texas Penal Code § 43.24
- Pervasively Vulgar – As referenced in the United States Supreme Court's plurality opinion in *Board of Education v. Pic*, 457 U.S. 853 (1982) and further clarified by Texas Commissioner Decision *Parent v. Lovejoy*, No. 073-R10-08-2024 (April 29, 2025), requires a finding of fact that vulgarity is present and referenced throughout the material. Since "pervasively" means existing in or spreading through every part of something, to determine if a material is "pervasively vulgar", one would need to review the entirety of the material.
- Educationally Unsuitable - as referenced in the United States Supreme Court's plurality opinion in *Board of Education v. Pico*, 457 U.S. 853 (1982) and further clarified by Texas Commissioner Decision *Parent v Lovejoy*, No. 073-R10-08-2024 (April 29, 2025), is a very broad term, and many factors could make a book

educationally unsuitable. A book could be determined unsuitable for some pedagogical reason, because it encourages harmful behaviors, or because of innumerable other factors. It could be determined due to specific sections of content, or holistically. Conversely, there are well recognized and respected works of literature that have been taught in public schools for generations that include portions of content that some find objectionable but that contain significant educational value when taken as a whole, and that may be deemed educationally suitable. Given the numerous factors that could be used, a finding of fact must include reasoning for a book being unsuitable or suitable.

- Indecent Content - Content that portrays sexual or excretory organs or activities in a way that is patently offensive. Texas Education Code § 33.020(2)
- Profane Content - Content that includes grossly offensive language that is considered a public nuisance. Texas Education Code § 33.020(4)

Required Considerations

1. Is the material "harmful material"? ~~_____~~

Yes, by a consensus the committee found the material to be harmful material with one member saying it was not.

2. Is the material "pervasively vulgar"?

Yes, by a consensus the committee found the material to be pervasively vulgar with one member saying it was not.

3. Is the material "educationally unsuitable"?

Yes, the consensus of the committee found the material to be "educationally unsuitable" with one member saying that it was not "educationally unsuitable."

4. Does the material contain "indecent content" or "profane content"?

Yes, the consensus of the committee found the material to be indecent and profane with one member saying that it was not.

5. Does the material refer a person to an internet website containing content prohibited by Board Policy or Texas Education Code Chapter 33?

No, the committee said it did not.

Additional Comments/Notes:

3 to 2 for keeping them together

Library Materials Challenge Recommendation (based on majority decision):

- Remove from WOISD libraries Continue use in WOISD libraries
 Relocate and/or restrict to:
 Elementary
 Junior High
 High School
 ____ + Age range

Review Committee:

Name	Position	Signature	Decision
Lori Davis	Librarian	<i>Lori Davis</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Retain <input type="checkbox"/> Relocate/Restrict <input type="checkbox"/> Remove
Debby Deek	Instructional Staff	<i>Debby Deek</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Retain <input type="checkbox"/> Relocate/Restrict <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Remove
Jon Carr	Parent	<i>Jon Carr</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Retain <input type="checkbox"/> Relocate/Restrict <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Remove
Heather Rejcek	Parent	<i>Heather Rejcek</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Retain <input type="checkbox"/> Relocate/Restrict <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Remove
Amber Richardson	Parent	<i>Amber Richardson</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Retain <input type="checkbox"/> Relocate/Restrict <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Remove